### **CALL TO ORDER:**

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 PM.

#### **ROLL CALL:**

Present were Chairman Michael Crevda, members Donald Schiffbauer and Sam Spann.

Also present were Assistant Law Director Toni Morgan and Deputy Clerk of Council Tina Wieber.

### **MINUTES:**

Chairman Crevda asked for discussion on the minutes of the regular meeting of Monday, September 27, 2021. He explained that he was absent from that meeting but did get a chance to review the minutes. No other discussion was offered.

It was moved by Schiffbauer and seconded by Spann to approve the minutes of Monday, September 27, 2021 as presented.

A voice vote was taken and the motion carried.

$$Yes - 3$$
  $No - 0$ 

### **REPORTS:**

None

#### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS:**

None

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

An Amendment to Rule VI, Sec. 2, regarding paramedic certification at the time of appointment.

Chairman Crevda asked the members if they had an opportunity to read Assistant Law Director Morgan's correspondence and if there were any questions regarding the language change on the firefighter entrance exam application. He explained the language change as "Applicants who pass the written examination shall be placed on the eligible list in order of their scores but they must possess Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) Certification along with any other requirements before they can be hired."

Member Schiffbauer noted that the last paragraph says, "Applicants for examination for original appointment to the fire department must have attained the age of 18 on or prior to the date of appointment and must show documentation that they are a State of Ohio Certified Paramedic at the time of hire". He asked if that was the proposed language.

Chairman Crevda stated he believed it was and asked the Assistant Law Director Morgan if that was correct.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that "at the time of hire" was the language that the commission is looking to add.

Chairman Crevda stated that what he quoted earlier was the prior language. He further explained that the new language would read "Applicants for examination for original appointment to the fire department as a firefighter must have attained the age of 18 on or prior to the date of appointment and must show documentation that they are a State of Ohio Certified Paramedic at the time of hire". He then asked for questions for comments from the Commission.

Member Schiffbauer applauded the City for taking this particular action. He explained that this will help increase the opportunity for potential applicants and allows the fire department to recruit early on in the process as some of their colleagues in the area have done already. He stated he was glad to see the change.

Chairman Crevda agreed. He made a motion to approve the new language in the application for Amendment to Rule VI, Section 2, regarding paramedic certification at the time of appointment.

It was moved by Crevda and seconded by Spann to approve the Amendment to Rule VI, Section 2, regarding paramedic certification at the time of appointment.

A voice vote was taken and the motion carried.

$$Yes - 3$$
  $No - 0$ 

Chairman Crevda stated next on the agenda was to review the agencies, cost and the calendar to decide on a date if possible for the Firefighter/Paramedic Class C entrance examinations. He explained that Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber prepared an excel spreadsheet with six agencies for the Commission to review regarding the fee structure for all of the agencies with some additional notes regarding the fee structures. He explained that included in their member packets were correspondence the Deputy Clerk of Council had with other surrounding municipalities and their preferences and experiences to agencies. Also included in the spreadsheet were dates for the examinations. He stated the agencies listed were Ohio Public Safety Exams, National Testing Network, IOS Solutions, Clancy & Associates, Ohio Fire Chiefs Association and CPS HR Consulting. He explained that from past experience the last agency that the Commission chose was Clancy & Associates and hadn't heard any bad feedback about them. He stated there was

only one appeal to an exam and that appeal was denied. He advised that he has heard only good things about Clancy & Associates but was aware that the Fire Chief was doing some consulting work for Clancy & Associates. Therefore, due to a potential conflict of interest, the Fire Chief was not present to advise what his preferences were regarding agencies to use for the examination. Fire Chief Reese would be available at a later time if the Commission chose not to decide on a date at the meeting. He explained that looking at the six agencies and their fee structures it appeared that the most cost effective fees are that of National Testing Network and IOS Solutions with Clancy & Associates being right in the middle and that the other three agencies were on the higher end. Chairman Crevda asked Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber if all six agencies were affordable and within the City's budget.

Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber advised that they were.

Chairman Crevda asked the Commission if they had any other questions or comments regarding fee structures.

Member Schiffbauer stated that with the exception of IOS Solutions whose fee was \$500 plus travel costs. He asked if that was an onsite fee.

Deputy Clerk of Council explained that IOS Solutions is not a local agency and would charge for travel and accommodations.

Chairman Crevda stated that per the email conversations that Deputy Clerk of Council engaged in with other clerks, that it looks like Rocky River had been using Ohio Public Safety Exams two to three times a year. He asked if their experiences with them were good.

Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber advised that they were.

Chairman Crevda explained that the city of Avon Lake prefers Clancy & Associates as did the city of North Ridgeville in the past. Bay Village Fire Chief prefers CPS HR Consulting because he feels it's a more difficult exam which equates to better candidates, in their opinion. He asked if the timing for all six agencies worked well with the North Ridgeville Fire & Paramedic exams as far as the dates that are available.

Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber advised that they did and the exam would be given in February on 2022 and that also on the spreadsheet was Tri-C's schedule for the agility testing prior to the exam.

Chairman Crevda stated that for the record, Tri-C is available for the physical agility dates on 12/5/2021, 1/9/2022 & 2/13/2022. He explained that it appears that all six agencies would qualify based on fee structure, dates available. He explained that there are three agencies that the cities of Rocky River, Avon Lake and Bay Village prefer. He asked for questions or comments from the Commission.

Member Schiffbauer explained that he understood the City had used Clancy & Associates in the past and the nice thing about that is past behavior is usually a good predictor of future behavior. He stated that while he appreciated the Bay Village Fire Chief's preference, he believes the test that has been given previously by the City of North Ridgeville has also yielded exceptional candidates. He advised that he had firsthand knowledge as being the recipient of some of their services. He explained that the City has not had any issues with Clancy & Associates and understands that it worked well for the fire department and appreciates that the city has a history with them. He stated he understood that there is a relationship between Clancy & Associates and Chief Reese. He explained that that sometimes happens when working closely with agencies and they like to avail themselves to some of the skill set and expertise that their customers lend but didn't think that should deter the Commission from considering engaging them in a testing agreement.

Chairman Crevda stated that he agreed with Member Schiffbauer's comments.

Member Spann explained that he agreed and that as far as pricing was concerned, Clancy's fees are very reasonable and putting together the quality and pricing would not break the budget but would be receiving the high quality testing and yielding high quality applicants. He stated that he thought Clancy was a good compromise of both pricing and quality and good past experience with the agency. He advised that he did not see a reason to increase costs or change agencies.

Chairman Crevda Stated that he agreed with both comments from the Commission members. He asked if anyone had any questions or comments to add.

Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber advised that Assistant Law Director Morgan wanted to make sure that the testing agencies scored using points rather than percentages and that Clancy used a point scoring system.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked if the other agencies scored using points as well.

Deputy Clerk of Council Wieber stated they did.

Chairman Crevda explained that the Commission had reviewed the agencies, the costs and the calendars and felt that they could make decision.

It was moved by Crevda and seconded by Spann to approve Clancy & Associates and their fee structure, their dates available as the agency of use for the Firefighter/Paramedic Class C Entrance Examination.

A voice vote was taken and the motion carried.

$$Yes - 3$$
  $No - 0$ 

Member Schiffbauer stated the next regular Civil Service Commission meeting was scheduled for Monday, November 22, 2021at 5:00 p.m.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked to return to previous discussion. She stated that under new business listed is "Amendment to Rule VI, Section 2, but that is actually something that just needs to be looked at at this time and voted on at the next meeting because it is a rule change. She further explained that the language Chairman Crevda was reading was on an application.

Chairman Crevda asked if that wasn't the Amendment to Rule VI, Section 2, or if that was different.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that it wasn't. She advised that the public notice can be changed now and the rule voted on later so that then the rule would actually match with the date of hire language. She stated that there were two sections on the public notice that need to have the language change. The first section that would need to be changed was the one Chairman Crevda read and the second was the very last sentence on the new public notice that indicates "After passing the written exam all candidates must be certified paramedics at the time of appointment" but it should use the same language "prior to date of hire". She asked if the Commission would change the very last sentence on the public notice to "prior to the date of hire" and change the wording on the application as well.

Chairman Crevda asked if they had the public notice.

Deputy Clerk of Council Morgan advised that the Commission did have the old version and the new version.

Assistant Law Director stated that the Commission really had not voted on the rule but would do so at the next meeting.

Chairman Crevda asked if it could be done at the current meeting.

Assistant Law Director Morgan explained that usually the Commission would review the rule change first and vote on it at the next meeting.

Member Schiffbauer stated that he had a copy of the public notice and that it said, "A paramedic certification must accompany the application and these documents will not be accepted after they have filed." He asked if that was the old notice.

Assistant Law Director Morgan advised that was the old notice.

Chairman Crevda stated that the new public notice reads, "Applicants who pass the written examination shall be placed on the eligible list in order of their scores. They must possess paramedic certification along with any other requirements prior to date of hire."

Assistant Law Director Morgan explained that the very last line on the next page of the public notice after the word paramedic would need to be changed to "prior to the date of hire" so that the language is consistent. She advised that the applicant could get hired and then not start immediately.

Member Schiffbauer advised that his only other comment would be regarding the wording "but they possess paramedic certification". He stated that with other certifications, as in nursing or the medical board, they can be active, inactive or restricted. He asked if the Commission should place additional verbiage that states "active paramedic certification" because an individual could have a paramedic certification but they may not be able to practice as a paramedic due to letting their certification lapse.

Assistant Law Director Morgan explained that the current rule states "must show documentation" and that they were looking at the notice. The rule says they must show documentation that they are a State of Ohio Certified Paramedic at the time and the Commission will add "or before date of hire". She further explained that is the language it would change to.

Member Schiffbauer stated he thought the language being said in the rule was fine and that they were looking at the public notice and thanked Assistant Law Director Morgan for the clarification.

Chairman Crevda explained that he was fine with the proposed changes.

Assistant Law Director Morgan advised that she will check with Chief Reese to get his thoughts on the use of the word active.

Member Schiffbauer stated that he may be referring to other boards that he is used to working with but for the purpose of the public notice as long as the language change is in the rule, they didn't need to worry about it with the public notice. And that it does convey that the applicant does need to be a paramedic before they start working.

Chairman Crevda asked for any other questions or comments.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked if the Commission would make a motion on the very last sentence of the public notice and that it should say "prior to the date of hire" so that it matched the front page.

Mr. Schiffbauer asked if the Assistant Law Director wanted the notice to read, "All candidates must be certified paramedics prior to the date of hire".

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that was correct. That was the language change was approved for the front page but wanted them to approve for the back as well.

Chairman Crevda explained that the Commission would approve the new language under the certification section that states, "All candidates must be certified paramedics at the time of filing their application" and the other is "Applicants who pass the written examination shall be placed on the eligible list in order of their scores but they must possess paramedic certification along with any other requirements prior to date of hire".

PAGE 7

Member Schiffbauer advised that that was incorrect. He explained that what the Assistant Law Director Morgan was referring to was the notice where it states, "The applicants who pass the written exam shall be placed on the eligible list in order of their scores but they must possess paramedic certification along with any other requirements prior to the date of hire" and then under certification, "All candidates must be certified paramedics prior to the date of hire".

It was moved by Crevda and seconded by Schiffbauer to approve the new language.

A voice vote was taken and the motion carried.

$$Yes - 3$$
  $No - 0$ 

### ADJOURNMENT:

It was moved by Crevda and seconded by Spann to adjourn the meeting.

A voice vote was taken and the motion carried.

$$Yes - 3$$
  $No - 0$ 

Muchol W. Col

The meeting was adjourned at 5:25 PM.

Michael Crevda

Chairman

Tina Wieher

Deputy Clerk of Council, Recording Secretary

Monday, November 22, 2021

**Date Approved**